~ Notes ~

N OTES TO THE Preface and Introduction are arranged by page number, with the text to which the note attaches appearing in bold.

PREFACE

axii of the "catalogue subgenre". See Benjamin Sammons, The Art and Rhetoric of the Homeric Catalogue (Oxford Univ. Press, 2010) (with extensive bibliography). Cf. TLL, 619 (note to p. 206). Sammons' excellent discussion (Chapter 4: "The Iliadic Catalogue of Ships") does not deal with what some see as the Catalogue's great antiquity—"the oldest piece of Greek verse we have" (Davis, 145–146); cf. Hooker, Mycenaean Greece, 7 (the Catalogue "preserves some accurate memories of Bronze Age sites in Greece"). Sammons focuses, amid much else, on the catalogue's (1) having been composed for the Iliad (not "imported" as a piece composed upon the Greek muster at Aulis nine years earlier); (2) "reinventing the army" (after its flight and disarray in Book 2) and giving it fresh life at the start of Homer's narrative nine years into the war; and (3) evidencing Panhellenic intent. See also Umberto Eco, The Infinity of Lists, Alastair McEwen, tr. (Rizzoli, 2009), esp. Chapters 1 and 2 (comparing the circular all-inclusiveness of Achilles' shield and Homer's otherwise open-ended and potentially infinite catalogues).

xl arrangement of words. The Lesbian Lyre abounds in discussion of diction and prosody, and the necessity of poetic form in relation to content. Classicist Robert Seymour Bridges (Poet Laureate 1913–1930) speaks of "the magical concurrence of high diction with metrical form [which] stands out in a clear configuration of beauty that makes them unforgettable and has enshrin'd them among the treasures of every cultur'd mind." He equates their destruction with that of "the mortar... between the stones." The mortar, "once hardly distinguishable from [the stone], would perish and rot away and would no longer serve to hold the fabric together" (Bridges [1928], 48).

Introduction

8 even the slightly odd. Guy Lee, Virgil: The Eclogues (Francis Cairns, 1980; rev. Penguin, 1984), 12. The idea of strangeness as an inherent part of poetry hearkens back to Aristotle (whom Lee may have had in mind). Aristotle speaks as follows of τὸ ξενικόν (pron. to xe-ni-kon', Eng. xenophobic) 'strangeness' or 'that which is strange':

Excellence of diction means clarity and avoidance of banality. Now, clearest is the diction that uses standard terms, but this is banal: the poetry of Cleophon and Sthenelus exemplifies this. Impressive and above the ordinary is the diction that uses exotic language (by "exotic" [ξενικόν] I mean loan words, metaphors, lengthenings, and all divergence from the standard). But if one composes entirely in this vein, the result will be either a riddle [ainigma]

NOTES

or barbarism—a riddle, if metaphors predominate; barbarism, if loan words [ek glōttōn 'outside the language']. For this is the nature of a riddle, to attach impossibilities to a description of real things. . . . Passages of loan words constitute barbarism. . . . So those who criticize such usage, and mock the poet for it, are wrong to carp. . . . moderation applies equally to all components. By using metaphors, loan words, and other classes inaptly one could achieve the same result as by deliberate comic distortion. But the difference it makes to use them fittingly in epic should be studied by introducing the standard words into the verse.

Aristotle, Poetics, Stephen Halliwell, ed./tr. (Harvard Univ. Press, Loeb Classical Library, 1995), 108–112 (§§1458a-b, XXII.17 et seq.) (emphasis added).

Note: "a certain blend of these components" and "moderation applies equally to all components." This reflects my own design, e.g., the intermittently archaic quality of this translation, etc. (pp. xxxix, xli, 14, 26). See further Aristotle, *Rhetoric*, III.2.3. (My thanks to Richard Janko for recalling the *Poetics* to my attention.)

A similar argument is more recently made with reference to the terms "foreign" and "domestic." Literary translation will sometimes use a strange, unusual, archaizing or other feature foreign to expected usage in reflecting the original's dignity or elevated manner. Literal translation, by contrast, will use the simplest, most straightforward, or domestic language in deference to the original's literal meaning. However, the circle comes full round to the view that to foreignize is ultimately to domesticate: "More often, though, archaizing is associated with domestication. In such cases, it is as if the translator feels the need of 'a natural habitat for the alien presence', which can be *present-ed*, paradoxically, as 'a part of one's own tradition temporarily mislaid.' Michael Silk, Ingo Gildenhard, and Rosemary Barrow, *The Classical Tradition: Art, Literature, Thought* (Wiley Blackwell, 2014), 175–176 (citing source).

The eminent Charlton T. Lewis (of *Lewis and Short Latin Dictionary* acclaim) dramatically notes that "Homer is a being from another world, and his strange language is the least of the barriers which shut our minds from his." Lewis, at the same time, and as other commentators, insists on Homer's simplicity of expression. There is nothing simple about Homer. It's Greek after all and highly ornate at that. See C. T. Lewis, "Mr. Bryant's Translation of the Iliad," *The North American Review*, 112.231 (1871), 348, 359, 361 (a 42-page tripartite review article discussing the Homeric Question, the requisites of Homeric translation, and the then recently published *Iliad* of William Cullen Bryant vis-à-vis his translator predecessors).

into thirds or halves. See Brad Leithauser, *Rhyme's Rooms: The Architecture of Poetry* (Knopf, 2022), 98–99. My own twelve-syllable line, by contrast, is variously divisible. It further avoids the iambic-hexametric label, as it is but partially—even if largely—iambic. Indeed, unrelieved iambs at epic length (even with intermittent trochees) would quickly fatigue. Especially noteworthy in this connection is Leithauser's "paean" to the iambic pentameter (no mere discussion but *paean*) and his near similar enthusiasm for the tetrameter, the latter but briefly including mention of the iambic hexameter (suggesting an open field).

a "metric periphery." The phrase "metric periphery" derives, by analogy, from Leithauser's reference to each peculiarity of "off rhyme, whether common or highly abstruse [that] creates its own acoustic reality." The less likely the rhyme or the words producing it (e.g., retina/retinue), the more lying "on the peripheries of the peripheries, and that's the point: There are, out there, far more musical effects than we know

JEFFREY M. DUBAN

how to assimilate" (Leithauser, 188). A consummate example of sound on the periphery is *Cafés and Cathedrals: Poems by C[arlyle] F[erren] MacIntyre* [1890–1967] (Oxford Univ. Press, 1939). MacIntyre's variously stanzaed sonnets and other poems insistently rely not only on near rhyme but also on the frequently unexpected similarity of verbal forms or appearances, all to excellent effect amid regularly enjambed lines. By hurrying the lines along—as it were—the enjambments temper the anomaly, the manner, the *mannerism* of such prosody.

than initially imagined. The only twelve-syllable epic known to this author is Michael Drayton's *Poly-Olbion* (*Much Blessed* or *In Many Ways Prosperous*) (1612–1622). The poem—in rhymed alexandrine couplets—is a topographical exposition of almost 15,000 lines, describing the landscape, history, traditions, and customs of early modern England and Wales. A favorite of specialists, it lacked acclaim owing to its meter and provincial subject matter (charming sooner than compelling). More specifically.

many readers took exception to Drayton's use of the six-footed Alexandrine line. Unusual even in Drayton's time, the Alexandrine was derided as "antiquated" by the standards of the latter half of the seventeenth century. Other readers derided the encyclopedic nature of the poem, perceived as hopelessly ambitious and set at odds with years in which poetry and history-writing were more often seen as separate kinds of enterprise.

Poly-Olbion: New Perspectives (Studies in Renaissance Literature, Vol. 38), Andrew McRae and Philip Schwyzer, eds. (D. S. Brewer, 2020), 9. On the alexandrine, see further **twelve-syllable line** below.

not being the original. Lee, 14.

Chapman, Pope, Dryden. The fame of the three translators has, of course, far outlived its critics. In the case of Dryden, with reference to vividness (especially as concerns his Latinisms), see, e.g., William Frost, *Dryden and the Art of Translation* (Yale Univ. Press / Oxford Univ. Press, 1955), 40–45. On Dryden see further *TLL*, 435 (with reference to Gary Wills' over-the-top comparison of Sarah Ruden's *Aeneid* to Dryden's).

4 **or decidedly bad.** See TLL, 432–434 (on Fagles' Aeneid).

curiosity-rousing. "The stories have become so well known that it can be hard to grasp the sheer strangeness of the original Greek texts"; the form of Homeric language was to the Alexandrian editors of Homer "already as distant from speakers of the third century BCE as Chaucer's English is from us." Roderick Beaton, *The Greeks:* A Global History (Basic Books, 2021), 51, 54. With emphasis on story rather than language, see Lateiner: The Iliad's "Forty days' interrupted fierce fighting for a few prime Anatolian acres around Troy town . . . seems a strange, even weird subject for any poem." Donald Lateiner, "The Iliad: an unpredictable classic" in The Cambridge Companion to Homer, Robert Fowler, ed. (Cambridge, 2004), 11. Robin Osborne similarly speaks of the appeal of Homer's "defamiliarisation" through anachronism ("Homeric Society" in Fowler, ed., 217), while James Porter references the "abyssal attraction" of Homer's appeal to the Iliad's past, asking whether Homer's readers are drawn "to the clarity of his poems or their opacity" ("Homer: the history of an idea" in Fowler, ed., 342).

Today, it is not unfair to say that Homeric Greek (c. 750 BC), and even Attic Greek (the Greek of the classical period, c. 450 BC) are to modern Greek what Old English is to speakers of English today (and of centuries long preceding), i.e., incomprehensible.

Homeric Greek, while often considered the easiest form of Greek (because of its various repetitions and formularity) is yet "a notorious challenge to modern students" (Beaton, 52). Indeed, though considered "easy," Homeric Greek is *Greek* nonetheless. And though one may learn Homeric Greek from the outset (with more than a single primer so designed), it does better first to learn the Attic basics, thence "backing into" Homer.

himself to hear him. As C. T. Lewis proposes, "The translator of Homer, who would make a rendering as adequate as a translator of Tasso or of Goethe may fairly aim at, must create all [of Homer's] simplicity and intensity of faith and fervor *in himself, and then must create an audience like himself to hear him*" (C. T. Lewis, 348). The translation must thus win the reader over to its particular sense and vision of the original.

epic poetry requires. "By force of its prestige, the *Iliad* sets the standard for the definition of the word epic: an expansive poem of enormous scope, composed in an old fashioned and superbly elevated style of language, concerning the wondrous deeds of heroes." Gregory Nagy, *The Ancient Greek Hero in 24 Hours* (Harvard Univ. Press, 2013), 9.

rein of a fixed meter. See *TLL*, Chapter 26: "Freedom, Freedom, Prison to the Free: The Obfuscatory Unfettered."

"desirable irregularities." As meter is determinative, it is meter that often dictates—and with entirely unanticipated results. Bridges observes that the poet working within a fixed form "adapted his matter to the exigencies of a prescrib'd form" and. so doing, "found a further reward, because the changes of his matter provoked and justifi'd all the vagaries of rhythm that his meter allow'd, so that their desirable irregularities came spontaneously, and his metrical form, harmonizing whatever he had to deal with, offer'd him endless opportunities for unexpected beauties." See Collected Essays Papers &c. of Robert Bridges: "II. Humdrum & harum-scarum: A lecture on free verse. III. Poetic diction" (Humphrey Milford, 1928), 50 (Bridge's customized orthography—with the exception of the perfect-tense ending 'd for ed—is regularized throughout; see further the conclusion of note to archaic Greek Kunstsprache, below. Similarly, Picasso: "Then, too, forcing yourself to use restricted means is the sort of restraint that liberates invention. It obliges you to make a kind of progress that you can't even imagine in advance." Quoted in Françoise Gilot and Carlton Lake, Life with Picasso (McGraw-Hill, 1964), 57. Since the restrictions of fixed meter dictate as they do, the critic should be wary of excessively commending dictional choices or ascribing them to express design.

I could not, it is true. Marcel Proust, Remembrance of Things Past: Swann's Way, Combray, C. K. Scott Moncrieff, tr. (Random House, 1934), 71–72, 75.

on *kleos* 'glory, fame'. *Kleos* is the focal point of epic/heroic concern. One may initially consult the subdividedly indexed references at *TLL*, 788; and the headings, beginning with "The Meaning of *Kleos*" in Nagy, *The Ancient Greek Hero*, 26–47.

not been disappointed. Jones Very, "Epic Poetry" in *Poems and Essays* (Little and Brown, 1839), 9.

human being, is inhumane. Thomas Mann, "The Unliterary Country" in Reflections

of a Nonpolitical Man, Walter D. Morris, tr. (New York Review of Books, 2021), 40; 1st pub. as Betrachtungen eines Unpolitischen (S. Fischer Verlag, 1918). On the "analysis of moral attitudes and mental states" in Homeric speeches, and the often abstract vocabulary reflecting them, see G. S. Kirk, *The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II: books 5-8* (Cambridge Univ. Press, 1990), 30–33.

its distinctive style. Dana Gioia, Longfellow in the Aftermath of Modernism (Longfellow's Wayside Inn, 2008), 23–24; reprinted from Gioia, Disappearing Ink: Poetry at the End of Print (Graywolf, 2004); 1st Pub., The Columbia History of American Poetry, Jay Parini, ed. (Columbia Univ. Press. 1993), 64–96. A superb monograph, and as a Wayside Inn publication, superbly illustrated.

twelve-syllable line. The resultant line, while akin to the French alexandrine, does not closely enough resemble it to warrant discussion. For the alexandrine vis-à-vis Homer, see Mark W. Edwards, Homer: Poet of the Iliad (Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1987), 45. See also Keith Waldrop, tr., "From Flowers of Evil: Charles Baudelaire," Conjunctions, 38 (2002), 349 ("A French meter, alexandrine or other . . . cannot be followed in English. An English alexandrine, for instance, has the same number of syllables as its French namesake, but no other relation."). As concerns the classics, the only twelve-syllable translations known to this author are Guy Lee's Eclogues (above-referenced) and C. S. Lewis' partial, posthumously published Aeneid in rhymed couplets (c. 1,520 lines in translation, including all of Book 1 and parts of Books 2 and 6). See C. S. Lewis's Lost Aeneid: Arms and the Exile, A. T. Reyes, ed. (Yale Univ. Press, 2011). In his review of Lee, Michael Putnam describes the meter as "English Alexandrine, iambic hexameter, and therefore essentially of twelve syllables." Review, Latomus, 41.1 (1982), 181. Bridges refers to the verse of his Lucretian-influenced The Testament of Beauty (1930) as his "loose alexandrines" (Book II.841), the majority of them being just that. See Robert Bridges, The Testament of Beauty: A Poem in Four Books (Oxford Univ. Press, 1930).

Iliad 1.1

SING, GOD | DESS, the wrath | of Pe | leus' son | Achilles, iamb anapest iamb iamb bacchius

/ / / / / / / / //

SING, GODDESS | the wrath of | Pe leus' son | Achilles, amphibrach amphibrach cretic bacchius

\smile	/	\smile	\smile	/	<i>_ /</i>	\smile	/	\sim	/ /
SING,	GOD	DESS	the w	rath	of Pe	leus'	son	Achi	lles,
amphibrach		iamb		iamb	iamb iamb		bacchius		
liad 2	4.804								

111111 24.004								
Done so the \mid rites for \mid Hector, \mid tamer of \mid horses.								
dactyl trochee spondee dactylic close								
Done so \mid the rites \mid for Hector, \mid tamer of \mid horses.								
iambs iamb amphibrach dactylic close								
Done so the \mid rites for Hec \mid tor tamer \mid of horses.								
amphibrach amphibrach bacchius								
(*Note, in final example, the lack of comma after Hector)								

"men's second thoughts." The priority of metrical over free-verse translation stands by analogy to Thoreau's elevation of the written over the spoken word, the latter often too extemporaneous to yield much of worth. Thus "language in its settled form is the record of men's second thoughts; a more faithful utterance than they can momentarily give." See *Henry D. Thoreau, Journal Vol. 1 (1837–1844)*, Elizabeth Hall Witherell et al., eds. (Princeton Univ. Press, 1981), 92.

merit of any work of art. Advice given by Allston to another painter, quoted in Jarred B. Flagg, *Washington Allston, Life and Letters* (Scribner's, 1892), 198–199.

definitive English translation. As C. T. Lewis states, "only a rash and narrow judgment will conclude in haste that the forty metrical translations of the Iliad already published, and the new one that appears every year, are wasted labor. The author of each of them has seen before him a staring gap in our literature, and has tried to fill it, and such attempts are sure to be continued until the work is pronounced, by common consent, either achieved or impossible" (Lewis, 328).

has never been translated. I look only to complete translations of the *Iliad*. My own lack of familiarity with a twelve-syllable *Iliad* aside, I have consulted the following (alphabetically listed): Charles Rowan Beye, "Homer in Translation: The Never-Ending Stream," *Arion* 20.3 (2013), 149–159; J. N. Douglas Bush, "English Translation of

Homer," Proceedings of the Modern Language Association," 41.2 (1926), 335-341 (correcting Foster); C. H. Conley, First English Translators of Homer (Kennikat, 1927, 1967); Finley M. K. Foster, English Translations from the Greek: A Bibliographical Survey (Columbia Univ. Press, 1918); A. G. Geddes, "Homer in Translation," Greece & Rome, 35.1 (1988), 1-13; Michael Nicoletseas, The Iliad—Twenty Centuries of Translation: A Critical View (CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform, 2012); Robert Shorrock, "The Values of Translation: Contestation and Creativity in Homer's English Iliads," International Journal of the Classical Tradition, 10.3/4 (2004), 438-453; George Steiner, Homer in English (Penguin, 1966); Steiner, "Homer in English Translation" in Fowler, ed.(2004), 363-375; Simeon Underwood, English Translators of Homer; from George Chapman to Christopher Logue (Northcote House, 1998); Philip H. Young, The Printed Homer: A 3000 Year Publishing and Translation History of the Iliad and Odyssey (McFarland, 2003). See also "English Translations of Homer" (Wikipedia) (a list of the English translations attributed to Homer, chronologically ordered by date of first publication, with first-line quotations); also "Published English Translations of Homer's *Iliad* and *Odyssey*," at http:// johnstoniadtexts.x10host.com/homer/langleafmyersiliad.htm.

common nor colloquial. As held by Anglo-Australian classicist Thomas George ("T. G.") Tucker (1859–1946), poetry is not the opposite of prose but the avoidance of the commonplace preconditional to the writing of poetry: "[A]s soon as a man begins to rise above the commonplace, as soon as his style begins to take on itself a rhythmic shape; his words are not satisfied to string themselves together in their work-a-day manner; words less trite and debased, more noble and sonorous, offer themselves as if by some law of nature, and those words arrange themselves in a more sweet and musical order."

T. G. Tucker, "The Nature and Province of Poetry" in Things Worth Thinking About: A Series of Lectures upon Literature and Culture (Thomas C. Lothian, 1909), 59, 61, 88–89 (Tucker, among much else, a consummate translator of Sappho [TLL, 91–95, 127–128]).

Similarly, Bridges "[As] things are now, the self denial [sic] of our common speech may be regarded as the generous and jealous guardian of our literary style." Bridges tellingly continues:

Since poetic language is essentially a rarity of expression of one sort or another, it is unreasonable to forbid apt and desirable forms merely because they are not read in the newspapers or heard at the dinner-table. And if once such unusual forms are admitted they will colour the keeping of the diction and invite a kindred vocabulary. It has lately become a fashion to use dialectal words in poetry. Such words are usually free of the stain of conventionality and since they are often better English words than their familiar synonyms, the only objection against them is that they are unknown or obscure. . . . But if, for instance such good old English words as [examples] should be rehabilitated . . . we should not only win back towards a closer relationship with our older literature . . . and we should thus add to that subtlety in the expression of ideas which by like means has become a peculiar excellence of our tongue." Bridges (1928), 67–68.

Tucker (above) speaks of the right dictional choices eventually offering themselves up "as if by some law of nature." Similarly, for certain poets, "it was natural to write at that height—their poetic diction . . . the spontaneous utterance of their subconscious mind." Bridges (1928), 69.

their approving reviewers. Emily Wilson's translation of the *Odyssey* (2017) is frequently commended for its contemporary and colloquial quality, this apparent from

the outset of her translation. See TSS, 78–79.

No "Yo, Achilles" here. See Daniel Mendelsohn, "Yo, Achilles," *New York Times*, 7/20/1997, a favorable review of Stanley Lombardo's Christopher-Logue–like translation of the *Iliad*. On the broadly approved depredations of Logue—everyone loves the "bad boy"—see *TLL*, 499–504.

The bad girl is also in fashion. Witness Maria Dahvana Headley, tr., Beowulf (Farrar, Straus & Giroux, 2020). The poem's famed opening word Hwaet 'So, Lo, Behold' is here translated 'Bro'! (the first of the salutation's many appearances; cf. "Yo," above). Notes a reviewer of this "updated" feminist translation: "Headley flattens Beowulf into the mold of twenty-first-century American masculinity in one of its crudest forms. He swaggers into the poem sporting his burnished helmet like a backward baseball hat, and leaves it in a blazing trail of clichés." As concerns the translation's gear-stripping verbal and imagistic mayhem, "This is a translation of the moment, and will age accordingly." Irina Dumitrescu, New York Review of Books, 12/3/2020. For a serious translation, one may consult Frederick Rebsamen, Beowulf: A Verse Translation (HarperCollins, 1991).

poetry preceding one's own. Christopher Clausen, "Poetry in Discouraging Times," *The Georgia Review*, 35.4 (1981), 707, quoting Josephine Miles, "Values in language; or, Where Have *Goodness, Truth*, and *Beauty Gone?*" in *The State of the Language*, Leonard Michaels and Christopher Ricks, eds. (Univ. of California Press, 1980), 365.

accounts lost by his time. Quintus of Smyrna: The Trojan Epic, Posthomerica, Alan James, tr. (Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 2004). The earlier accounts, by authors other than Homer, and for that reason inferior, were part of the "Epic Cycle." These provided preliminaries to the accounts related in the Iliad and Odyssey. Authors aside from Quintus provided aftermath to Homer, the Cycle possibly "retro-constructed" to Creation itself or indefinitely projected. See TLL, 171–176. Epic, i.e., poetry in epē, or dactylic hexameter, is thus generically all-inclusive, theoretically disallowing nothing too early, too recent, or prospective.

and textual codification. See M. L. West, *The Making of the Iliad: Disquisition and Analytical Commentary* (Oxford Univ. Press, 2011), 4; and Susan Stewart, "The Unfinished: On the Nonfinality of Certain Works of Art" (referencing Pliny and the *Iliad*) in *The Ruins Lesson: Meaning and Material in Western Culture* (Univ. of Chicago Press, 2020), 230–233.

works ever in progress. C. T. Lewis, proposes that whatever errors or imperfections exist in Bryant's translation "may be remedied upon revision, without affecting the general tone and style; and were they all corrected, so that no positive error or marked defect could be found, few readers would notice any change. There is no other English Iliad which could be made by corrections to represent Homer, on the whole, as well as Mr. Bryant represents him now" (Lewis, 368).

when seeming finished. Leonardo, however, is a case study in diffidence deriving from a chronic sense of incompletion, from his essential sense of *faciebat*. As Vasari (not always reliable) notes, "His intelligence in Art made him take on many projects but never finish any of them, since it seemed to him that the hand would never achieve the required perfection." Such, poignantly, is the case with his "Mona Lisa," deemed his masterpiece and afforded near sacred reverence throughout the world. Yet, to Leonardo's mind, it too remained unfinished. He returned to the painting obsessively, taking it with him whenever he traveled. Indeed, it was among his meager possessions

when, in old age, he crossed the Alps to work at the behest of Francis I. See also Paul Strathern, *The Florentines: From Dante to Galileo: The Transformation of Western Civilization* (Pegasus Books, 2021), 234.

10 In the English Language. See TLL, 463, quoting William Arrowsmith, "The Decade of Five Iliads," The Hudson Review, 5.3 (1952), 432–443.

were very unpopular. Pliny, Natural History, Vol. I: Preface, Books I and II, H. Rackham, tr. (Harvard Univ. Press, Loeb Classical Library, 1938–1949), Preface, 26–27.

imperfect tense indicating. For the view that "Often, particularly in early Greek and later in the most polished prose, to our way of thinking imperfect and aorist are used completely interchangeably in reports of the past," see David Langslow, Lecture I, 32, in *Jacob Wackernagel, Lectures on Syntax: with special reference to Greek, Latin, and Germanic*, edited with notes and bibliography by David Langslow (Oxford Univ. Press, 2009), 235–238; 1st pub., (in German).

The "aorist" is an archaic and classical Greek tense indicating simple past action, i.e., "I made" (once only) versus perfect tense "I have made" (repeatedly). The fluidity of the two tenses in Homer is consistent with the demands of *Kunstsprache*. Latin had no aorist, only the perfect. The Langslow lecture covers the range of ancient Greek tenses. My thanks to James Diggle for bringing this article to my attention.

11 or necessarily incomplete. Noteworthy in this connection is the eleventh-century French rabbi and exegete Shlomo Yitzchaki (AKA "Rashi"), author of comprehensive commentaries on the Hebrew Bible (or Torah) and Talmud (the centerpiece of Jewish religious law and theology). Rashi's revered commentary on the Torah highlights the medieval Hebrew literature phenomenon of "the open book." Certain authors tended "to circulate different versions of their work in an interim state," thinking "that scribes ("supercommentators") might alter or interpret a previously 'published work.' The author himself expected shifts in his state of knowledge for any number of reasons, the most obvious being the discovery of new insights over time, though other unexpected factors could play a role." Such factors included the "realia" of an encounter with the land of Israel or the access, once there, to previously unknown books." The work's ongoing existence in a state "textual fluidity"—its continuous status as a "work in progress" (i.e., faciebat)—has significant bearing on notions of finality and canonization. See Eric Lawee, Rashi's Commentary on the Torah: Canonization and Resistance in the Reception of a Jewish Classic (Oxford Univ. Press, 2019), 16, 19–20.

Florentine, was making this. Such manner of signature later appears on violin labels, usually replicas, e.g., Antonius Stradivarius cremonensis faciebat anno 1713 'Antonius Stradivarius of Cremona worked on this in the year 1713'. Moving briefly from instrument to performance, we note that famed pianist Arthur Rubinstein (1887–1982), relentlessly concertizing, was asked when he found time to practice. "At every performance" was his response. It is noted that Lat. facio 'I make' here has its counterpart in Gr. poieō 'I make'; poietēs 'poet'. The poet, or any creator of art, is a maker, with whatever latitude and license the making might reasonably require and sustain; the making, to the artist, often incomplete or taken as far as then conceived or possible. The Cretan-born, Italy- and Spain-migrated El Greco, using his given names, signed some of his paintings—most notably "View of Toledo" (c. 1596–1600)—with the Greek equivalent of the Latin disclaimer: Δομήνικος Θεοτοκόπουλος ἐποίει 'Domēnikos Theotokopoulos worked on this'—epoiei (imperfect of poieō) = faciebat.

more polished without it. From Cowper's letters, as quoted by Daisy Hay, Dinner with Joseph Johnson: Books and Friendship in a Revolutionary Age (Princeton Univ. Press, 2022), 120.

necessarily imperfect result. Further, and necessarily, imperfect are knowledge and understanding, human nature, polity, and ideals of justice. Though being one's "best self" is mere shorthand and cliché, the striving for perfection embraces human nature. One seeks to pursue "a perfect self image in the eyes of others," even as Benjamin Franklin wrote that life was "the bold and arduous project of arriving at self-perfection." See Tara Isabel Burton, Self-Made: Creating Our Identities from Da Vinci to the Kardashians (Public affairs, 2023), as reviewed by Dominic Green, "The Path to Perfection," The Wall Street Journal, 10/4/2023 (Bookshelf). For "Vitruvian Man" as the summation of bodily perfection in sync with the fundamental geometric patterns of the cosmic order, see TLL, 306. As concerns knowledge, it is always provisional and open to improvement. See Paul Strathern, The Other Renaissance: From Copernicus to Shakespeare: How the Renaissance in Northern Europe Transformed the World (Pegasus Books, 2023), 35 (discussing the German-born "father of humanism," Nicholas of Cusa). The same applies to devotion and love. Though Hamlet, in an echo of Sophocles' Antigone, exclaims "What a piece of work is man! How noble in reason! . . . " (Act II, Sc. II), he finishes by dismissing all as a "quintessence of dust." In the end, and because our natures, wills, bodies, and the world itself are corruptible, so is perfection unobtainable.

What we call the music of the spheres often serves as the paradigm of perfection. "Einstein once said that while Beethoven created his music, Mozart's 'was so pure that it seemed to have been ever-present in the universe, waiting to be discovered by the master.' Einstein believed much the same of physics, that beyond observations and theory lay the music of the spheres—which, he wrote, revealed a 'pre-established harmony' exhibiting stunning symmetries. The laws of nature, such as those of relativity theory, were waiting to be plucked out of the cosmos by someone with a sympathetic ear" (from an essay by Arthur Miller, New York Times, 1/31/2006). For perfection in Bach (with reference to the Toccata and Fugue in D minor and St. Matthew Passion), see Algis Valiunas, "Bach the Transcendent: Truth and Eternal Harmonies," Claremont Review of Books, 14.2 Spring 2014 (essays).

Milman Parry (1902–1935). The quotations in this paragraph derive from Adam Nicholson, Why Homer Matters (Henry Holt, 2014), 75, 78–80 (an excellent and exuberant book). On the Parry-Lord theory of oral composition, see TLL, 197–198, 606, 616–617. The theory, developed in the 1930s, revolutionized Homeric studies, demonstrating that Homeric style was distinguished by the pervasive use of fixed expressions or "formulas" used for expressing a given idea under the same metrical conditions (the theory far more flexible than its initial formulations and findings indicated). Parry's collected writings were published as The Making of Homeric Verse, Adam Parry, ed. (Oxford Univ. Press, 1971). See also The Making of Homeric Verse: The Collected Papers of Milman Parry, Adam Parry, ed. (Oxford Univ. Press, 1987) ("it was not the smallest accomplishment of Parry's Homeric theory that it made the whole Unitarian-Analyst controversy, at least in its oldest and best-known form, obsolete," li); and Albert B. Lord, The Singer of Tales (Harvard Univ. Press, 1960) (2d ed., 2000, by Stephen Mitchell and Gregory Nagy). See recently Robert Kanigel, Hearing Homer's Song: The Brief Life and Big Idea of Milman Parry (Knopf, 2021).

12 **A 2020 review article.** George L. Huxley, "The Lesbian Lyre: Reclaiming Sappho for the 21st Century," Hermathena, 199 (2015), 241–248 (issued in 2020).

when something is replaced. Noting the accelerative change of language usage, Brad Leithauser laments his students' difficulty reading Dickens' A Tale of Two Cities: "The Novel's diction impedes them as it wouldn't have fifty years ago, and still less a hundred years ago" (319). While Beowulf requires modern-English translation, Chaucer, Spenser, Shakespeare, and others, with a bit of application, do not. Yet they are now available in updated English versions in the "Classics Retold" series. The series lays claim to preserving the themes and, yes, integrity of the originals. The practice has strangely encroached on once classical but now apparently dated translations of the classics themselves. Thus, e.g., the bizarrely re-Englished or "revised" Homeric translation, famed in its day, of Samuel Butler (1835–1902). Is there nothing better for already well-published classicists to be doing? See https://chs.harvard.edu/primary-source/ homeric-iliad-sb. The practice seems to have started with William F. Wyatt's updating (1999) of A. T. Murray's translation of the *Iliad* (1924) for Harvard's Loeb Classical Library—a rendering that "retains Murray's admirable style but is written for today's readers." Should today's style-needy readers suffer the compromise of an earlier admirable style? And how will today's readers be expected to undertake Homer in Greek (quite doable, actually), if they are spoon-fed re-Englished translations?

worthy of our attention. Bertrand Russell, "On Being Modern-minded" in Unpopular Essays (Simon and Schuster, 1950), 65. Conversely, modernity—i.e., the present—is a fallen state vis-à-vis some receded golden age, see e.g., Hesiod's "Five Races/Ages of Man" (Hesiod's own age, he laments, the most iron and worst of all). Within the Spenglerian scheme (The Decline of the West, 1918, 1922), the present, emerging from a millennial-long development of race and culture into civilization, is predetermined for decline, owing to the excess and complacency of attainment. The depiction of present decline is pervasive, from Jacque's "All the world's a stage" to the Mishnaic tract Savings of the Fathers (Pirkē Avot), Ch. 3. Development followed by dissolution is depicted in Thomas Cole's five-painting cycle "The Course of Empire" (1833-1836), recapitulated on the individual level in his four-painting cycle "Voyage of Life" (1840, 1842). Disenchantment with the present, exemplified in Wagner's Ring, was endemic to nineteenth-century German thinking—the ideal being the interpretation and transfiguration of the remote past as template for a utopian future (utopia apparently immune to decline). See Alex Ross, Wagnerism: Art and Politics in the Shadow of Music (Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2020), 70-71 (Wagner "first and foremost modern," a precursor to the modernists themselves); also Jed Rasula, What the Thunder Said: How The Waste Land Made Poetry Modern (Princeton Univ. Press, 2022), 4 ("The Waste Land a Wagnerian poem sharing Richard Wagner's vision of the remote past as a template for the future.").

archaic Greek Kunstsprache. Of comparable archaism and artfulness were the Elizabethan and Restoration poets—Spenser (1552–1599), Sidney (1554–1586), Chapman (1559–1634), Marlowe (1564–1593), and Shakespeare (1564–1616); Milton (1608–1674) and Dryden (1631–1700). It is to their example that this translation intermittently looks. However archaic from a twentieth or twenty-first century perspective we consider them, they (as Homer) were archaic in their own time—archaism, artificiality, and ornamentalism the hallmarks of Elizabethan exuberance. The same obtained under Elizabeth's successor James I, who commissioned and oversaw publication of the epochal (and namesake) King James Bible (KJB) (1611). The KJB, following and systematically improving upon the Wycliff, Tyndale, and Coverdale translations, was broadly known and long admired for its archaism and elevation (conveying the same qualities of its Hebrew original).

13 **archaic in English Ears.** Edmund Lenthal Swifte, *Homeric Studies* (1868) (FOR PRIVATE DISTRIBUTION) (Kessinger, n.d.), 6.

the hashtag #DisruptTexts. See Meghan Cox Gurdon, "Even Homer Gets Mobbed: A Massachusetts School has banned the Odyssey," *Wall Street Journal*, 12/28/2020 (Opinion); in response, Angel Adams Parham, "Don't Cancel the Classics, Broaden and Diversify Them," *Wall Street Journal*, 5/21–22/2022 (Opinion). See also Sara L. Hales and Arum Park, "Teaching Classics in the Age of #MeToo," *Society for Classical Studies Blog*, 2/14/2018.(hand-wringing over classical narratives of sexual assault).

14 "Jefferson and Homer." For a neatly summarized account of Jefferson and the classics with particular emphasis on Homer, see Jefferson's Literary Commonplace Book, Douglas L. Wilson ed. (Princeton Univ. Press, 1989), 165–166, in The Papers of Thomas Jefferson, Charles T. Cullen, ed. (second series).

the eighth centuries. Beaton, 58–59, adducing, e.g., the *Iliad*'s Mycenaean bronze weaponry, superseded by iron well before Homer's time—iron frequently mentioned in the *Iliad*—and Bronze Age battle chariots. The latter were unfamiliar to Homeric audiences and are used with casual uncertainty in the *Iliad*'s battle scenes—more for individual attack and battlefield conveyance than as a means of wholesale engagement. See also Margalit Finkelberg, "Homer and the Bottomless Well of the Past" in *Homer and Early Greek Epic* (De Gruyter, 2020), 269–277; and Finkelberg, *Greeks and Pre-Greeks: Aegean Prehistory and Greek Heroic Tradition* (Cambridge Univ. Press, 2005) (with chapters "The heterogeneity of Greek genealogy" and "The spread of the Greek language").

performance or text. John Miles Foley, *Immanent Art: From Structure to Meaning in Traditional Oral Epic* (Indiana Univ. Press, 1991), 7.

both archaic register. Francis W. Newman, in his 1856 *Iliad* translation—giving rise to Matthew Arnold's famed On Translating Homer (1861)—adopted an antiquated style reflecting what he rightly took, but poorly executed, as Homer's own antique style. He further teetered in the use of excessively archaic words ("as much Saxo-Norman as possible") and more, in his use of ballad meter, which Arnold condemned as singularly inappropriate to the rendering of Homeric hexameter. See Matthew Arnold, On the Study of Celtic Literature and On Translating Homer (Macmillan, 1883, 1902), 146, 178-183,197-200, 232-233; 1st pub. as On Translating Homer: Three Lectures Given at Oxford (Longman, 1861). I discuss the poetic and historical dimensions of the hexameter in my earlier work. See TLL, esp. 448–451, 458 (and notes at 697); also 775 (index, "hexameter"). On the social and political underpinnings of the Arnold-Newman controversy, see Tamara Chin, "Anti-Colonial Metrics: Homeric Time in an Indian Prison, ca. 1900," English Literary History, 81.3 (2014), 1032–1036 (article dealing with the classically educated Indian philosopher, poet, and spiritualist Aurobindo Ghose [1872–1950]; highlighting his work on Greek metrics and his own *Ilion: An Epic in Quantitative Hexameters*). See further "The hexameter controversy" in The Cambridge History of English and American Literature (Cambridge Univ. Press, 1907-1921). xviii/I, ch. 7, s.14; and Bridges, Ibant Obscuri: an experiment in classical hexameter (Oxford Univ. at the Clarendon Press, 1916).

"old enough to be new." As concerns "making it new by making it old," see *TLL*, 267, 453, 525.

the poetry of the past. Geddes, "Homer in Translation," 4-5.

15 **national and literary future.** Lucy Munro, *Archaic Style in English Literature*, 1590–1674 (Cambridge Univ. Press, 2013), 3, 4, and 5 (citing sources). See further Susan Rather, *Archaism, Modernism, and the Art of Paul Manship* (Univ. of Texas Press, Austin, 1993) (arguing for "archaism as a modernist mode of representation in early twentieth-century sculpture . . . its assimilation [traced] to the academy and popular culture"). Manship's "Briseis" serves as cover art for this book.

forms appear but once. Bruce Robert McElderry, Jr., "Archaism and Innovation in Spenser's Poetic Diction," *Proceedings of the Modern Language Association*, 47.1 (1932), 145. Also, "The subject-matter of *The Faerie Queene* is itself the most powerful factor in creating the impression of archaism"; archaisms "thoroughly blended with chivalric material, while at the same time . . . still easily intelligible" (McElderry, 159). For the chivalric comportment of Homeric heroes, see pp. 15, 49, 130, 181, 219.

as the rhyme requires. Coleridge's Miscellaneous Criticism, Thomas Middleton Raysor, ed. (Cambridge/Harvard Univ. Press, 1936), 38.

Shakespeare, and Milton. Raysor, ed., 33.

16 from everyday speech. See TLL, 267 and 641 (citing sources). For the instances of Homeric Kunstsprache, see Part IV herein.

poetry (and often prose). See Victor Bers, "Kunstprosa: Philosophy, History, Oratory" in Bakker, ed., 455–467.

was founded on Homer. "How to Read" in *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, T. S. Eliot, ed. (New Directions, 1935), 21; 1st. pub. *New York Herald Tribune* (Books), 1929.

the course of thought. Gregor, "Translation," 483.

not a translation at all. John Sallis, "The End of Translation" in *Translation & the Classics: Identity as Change in the History of Culture*, Alexandra Lianeri and Vanda Zajko, eds. (Oxford Univ. Press, 2008), 53. Sallis, however, continues: "What is the measure? The translation produced is supposed to be true to the original, true to the text (or speech) from which it is produced and of which it is alleged to be a translation. But what is this truth of translation? What does truth mean in this connection? Presumably it consists in the translation's corresponding to the original, in its being like the original. But what sense does correspondence have here? Correspondence in what respect? And how can a word, phrase, or sentence in one language be like a word, phrase, or sentence in another language?"

without disappointing it. Samuel Johnson, "Dryden" in Lives of the English Poets, Vol. 1, Cowley—Dryden, George Birkbeck Hill, ed. (Octagon Books, 1967), 467, §349; cf. "Cowley," 47, §141. See further William Cullen Bryant, "On the Use of Trisyllabic Feet in Iambic Measure" in Prose Writings of William Cullen Bryant, Vol. I, Essays, Tales, and Orations, Parke Godwin, ed. (D. Appleton, 1889), 57–67; 1st pub. North American Review (12/1819) (Bryant the first American translator of Homer). See also Bridges, "The Necessity of Poetry" in Collected Essays Papers &c. of Robert Bridges XXVIII (Oxford, 1918, 1936), 222 ("Secondly, a great deal of our pleasure in beauty, whether natural or artistic, depends in slight variations of a definite form").

a contemporary audience. Quotations from the estimable Robert Shorrock, "The Values of Translation: Contestation and Creativity in Homer's English Iliads," International Journal of the Classical Tradition, 10.3/4 (2004), 447–448. It follows from Shorrock's argument that "elevated, 'poetic' diction has little place in this scheme." Shorrock's rejection of poetic diction is suspect, based, as it is, on the view that "'most of Homer is a story naturally told.'" Shorrock's view derives from W. H. D. Rouse's decidedly simplified prose rendering, styled: The Story of Achilles: Translation of Homer's Iliad into plain English (Nelson, 1938), v. Homer, to be sure, is a straightforward story—digressions aside—but one as naturally told as not.

17 **owe their existence to it.** George M. Hyde, "Literary Translation," *Hungarian Studies in English*, 22 (1991), 43.

twentieth-century modernism. The debasements of modernism are covered at length in *TLL*, Chapters 25 and 34 (see also pp. 12, 17). The line between original poetry and poetry in translation being difficult to draw (*TLL*, 13, 93), original poetry often conditions or reflects the state of poetry in translation. It is a matter of structure and aesthetic. As Gioia asks:

How does a poet best shape words, images, and ideas into meaning? How much compression is needed to transform versified lines—be they metrical or free—into poetry? The real issues presented by American poetry will [be]: the debasement of poetic language; the prolixity of the lyric; the bankruptcy of the confessional mode; the inability to establish a meaningful aesthetic for new poetic narrative; and the denial of musical texture in the contemporary poem. The revival of traditional forms will be seen . . . as only one response to this troubling situation. . . .

Dana Gioia, Can Poetry Matter?: Essays on Poetry and American Culture (Graywolf Press, 1992, 2002), 41. Gioia's pessimism concerning the state of poetry recalls Shankman's 1983 appraisal of the state of Homeric translation; see *TLL*, 478–479 (quoting Shankman's express disavowal of all Homeric translation following, and likely to follow, Pope).

and algorithmic analyses. See, e.g., Richard Janko, Homer, Hesiod, and the Hymns: Diachronic development in epic diction (Cambridge Univ. Press, 1982, 2007); and Carolyn Higbie, Measure and Music: Enjambment and Sentence Structure in the Iliad (Oxford Univ. at the Clarendon Press, 1990, 2006).

the official cause of enmity. Previous grievances over the East-West theft of women—Io, Medea—went unpunished until the theft of Helen and the leveling of Troy on her account. See Herodotus 1.1-5 in *The Histories*, Robin Waterfield tr., Introduction and Notes by Carolyn Dewald (Oxford Univ. Press, 1998, 2008), 4–5.

18 **in short, he invented Greece.** Nicholas Jubber, *Epic Continent: Adventures in the Great Stories of Europe* (Nicholas Brealey, 2019), 27.

Roman assimilation. For highlights of this process, see *TLL*, Chapter 21, "Growing Latin from Greek Roots; Rome's Imperial Vision and Its Aftermath."

an archaic Greek poet. The poetry of Homer, Hesiod, and the lyricists (8th–6th centuries BC) is properly called archaic Greek poetry (Gr. *archaios* 'old'). The terminus

for the archaic period may be placed at the landmark of Xerxes' invasion of Greece, 480–479 BC. See Anthony Snodgrass, *Archaic Greece: The Age of Experiment* (Univ. of California Press, 1980), 212. Archaic literature is generally distinguished from the classical literature of the "Golden Age" of Athens (5th century BC), followed in turn by Hellenistic literature in the aftermath of Alexander (4th century BC). Writers nonetheless often use *classical* or *ancient* to include *archaic*, though *archaic* provides a significant chronological and cultural referent.

JEFFREY M. DUBAN

would be inevitable. Janko, 16-17. There is also "linguistic archaeology" (including Linear B) showing that "the *Iliad* is studded with expressions at least belonging to the sixteenth or fifteenth century BC, expressions that match the contemporary fighting gear, for example, in the Shaft Graves of Mycenae." See Emily Townsend Vermeule, "Jefferson and Homer," Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society, 137.4 (1993), 698. Earlier relating Homeric descriptions to sixteenth-century artifact is H[ilda] L[ockhart] Lorimer, "Homer's Use of the Past," Journal of Hellenic Studies, 49.2 (1929), 150. The Mycenaean element in Homer (including "Nestor's cup" or "Dove Cup") is further discussed below. The controversy surrounding Mycenaean influence is considered, dismissively, by M. I. Finley, The World of Odysseus (Viking, 1954: 4th ed., 1972), xiii-xvi, 39-40, 43, 157-159. The 1972 edition of Finley's ever popular work curiously omits mention of Vermeule, Lorimer, and T. B. L. Webster, From Mycenae to Homer (Norton, 1964). Similarly, O. T. P. K. Dickinson, "The Poet of the Dark Age," Greece & Rome, 33.1 (1986), 20–37 (like Finley, but at far greater length, downplaying Mycenaean in favor of Dark Age influence on Homer). Contra M. L. West, "The Rise of the Greek Epic," Journal of Hellenic Studies, 108 (1988), 151 ("Almost everyone accepts that the Greek epic tradition goes back at least to late Mycenaean times. In fact . . . there is reason to assume its existence as early as the fifteenth century," etc.).

Especially noteworthy is Fred W. Householder and Gregory Nagy, *Greek: A Survey of Recent Work* (Mouton, 1976) (H–N page numbers in brackets), covering, *inter alia* (1) "generally archaic but specifically Mycenaean lexical reflexes in epic," with particular reference to Denys Page, *History and the Homeric Iliad* (Univ. of California Press, 1959, 1966) [21]; (2) the "relationship of archaisms to innovations" (cf. Janko, above) [21]; (3) the relative earliness or lateness of particular passages on grammatical grounds [22]; (4) Homeric preservation of archaisms lost elsewhere in extant Greek [41]; (5) the archaism of Gr. $h\bar{e}r\bar{o}s$ 'hero' (often translated as 'warrior') owing to its "highly restrictive positional range" in epic meter [51]; (6) the evolution of the Mycenaean mother goddess in general and of Athena in particular [52]; and (7) the dialect situation in late Bronze Age Greece as deduced from Linear B and the dialect layers embedded in Homer [58–59].

recitational development. Thought principally to have occurred, as noted, from the Trojan War c. 1250 BC to the "era of incipient Homeric audience" c. 750 BC (see TLL, 178-181).

are a function of dialect. The issue of ancient Greek dialects and their disposition throughout Homeric epic is contentious, to say the least. "The history of Greek from the introduction of the alphabet until the *Koine* is the history of the dialects. In the Archaic and Classical periods the Greek language is an abstract notion in the sense that there was no standard language, but a collection of dialects that we think were mostly mutually intelligible. . . . the notion that a language is a standard with a set of variations (dialects) is a better idea . . . "(Stephen Colvin, "Greek Dialects in the Archaic and Classical Ages" in Bakker, ed., 200); also "The literary dialects are almost never pure, admit frequent interference from other dialects, and may also display elements

that were never part of any spoken variety. Rather than 'dialects,' it would be more correct to describe them as literary languages" (Tribulato, "Literary Dialects" in Bakker, ed., 388). As concerns the troublesome distinction between genuine and customized dialectical forms, the latter resulting from metrical requirements, see, e.g., William F. Wyatt, Jr., "Homer's Linguistic Forebears," *Journal of Hellenic Studies*, 112 (1992), 167–173. Notwithstanding an Aeolic phase in the development of the epic tradition, Wyatt debunks the then popular notion of originally Aeolic epic "translated" into Ionic when Ionian bards took the lead in epic composition, a supposition on which "everything that appeared archaic in the Homeric language was termed an 'Aeolism.'" On the "Aeolic phase" in epic, see further Jones (2012).

To simplify, Greek philologists of the Hellenistic Period (late 4th to late 1st centuries BC) distinguished four ancient Greek dialects or dialect groups: (1) Old Ionic aka Homeric or epic Greek, and New Ionic (Herodotus, Hippocrates); (2) Aeolic (Sappho, Alcaeus); (3) Doric (Pindar, Ibycus, Alcman); and (4) Attic (5th century Athens; the tragedians, Thucydides, Plato, Aristotle). Koine Greek was a later development. See further *TLL*, 65–71. For dialect distribution relevant to Homer, see endpapers map. For the broader scope of distribution of dialect as a feature of archaic Greek race or ethnography, see J. T. Hooker, *Mycenaean Greece* (Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1976), 163.

For still-useful guides, see J. S. Baird, *Homeric Dialect: Its Leading Forms and Peculiarities* (George Bell, 1879); Thomas D. Seymour, *Introduction to the Language and Verse of Homer* (Ginn & Co., 1889); and Richard John Cunliffe, *A Lexicon to the Homeric Dialect* (Blackie, 1924; Univ. of Oklahoma Press, 1963, 1977).

trained and probing minds. Vermeule, 692. (The epigraph to Part II herein appears at Vermeule, 697.) As concerns "layers of new language piled on old language, former dialects and modern dialects," the phenomenon is systematically treated by Plutarch (46–119 AD)—or "Plutarch," authorial attribution uncertain—in *The Essay on the Life and Poetry of Homer,* J. J. Keaney and Robert Lamberton, eds. (Scholars Press, 1996). The cited work, with facing Greek and English texts, runs to almost three hundred pages, surveying such topics as diction, heroic hexameter, dialect usages, and syntactical peculiarities traced to dialect, archaisms, tropes, and figures of speech. I return to "Plutarch" in Part IV. The topic of Homer's language is immense. See the lengthy and highly detailed discussion by L. R. Palmer, "The Language of Homer" in Alan Wace and Frank Stubbings, eds., A Companion to Homer (Macmillian, 1962), 75–178.

20 is "soaked in retrospect." As noted by Adam Nicolson in his immensely instructive Why Homer Matters (Henry Holt, 2014), 64. In a National Geographic interview following publication, Nicolson backdates Homeric origins to "around 2000 B.C.—about 1,000 or 1,200 years earlier than most people say Homer existed." "[T]here are elements of the Homeric stories," he continues, "particularly the Iliad, that are shared among the Indo-European world as a whole, all the way from north India through Greece to Germanic and Icelandic stories. These are deep elements in Homer that have nothing to do with Greece or the Aegean." See "Author Says a Whole Culture—Not a Single 'Homer'—Wrote 'Iliad,' 'Odyssey,'" Simon Worrall, FOR NATIONAL GEOGRAPHIC (1/3/2015).

Nicolson elaborates on this proposal in *Why Homer Matters*, emphasizing Homer's antiquity as follows: "Homer's urgency comes from the pain associated with that clash of worlds (the Eurasian and Mediterranean) and his immediacy from the eternal principles at stake" (2); Epic is the attempt to extend the qualities of memory over the reach of time embraced by history. "Epic's purpose is to make the distant past as immediate to us as our own lives, to make the great stories of long ago beautiful

and painful now" (3); Certain kinds of Homeric armor, as described, are more than simply archaic in Homer's time: "This is the equipment of a profoundly ancient world" (103); "Clues to ancient ghostly layers are everywhere in Homer . . . deep tradition 'floats all through the songs as dust through air.' About 20% of the whole of Homer looks as if it was originally composed in a Greek [predating] Linear B... that is, before 1,400 BC." (108, quoting Emily Vermeule); "Homer is full of half-buried memories of that northern [Eurasian] past, and his recollections hint at another non-Mediterranean world, far from water, far from cities, landlocked, dominated by an enormous sky, horse-rich, focussed on flocks and herds and the meat they provide, violent, mobile, and heroic" (144); We, no less than Homer, are heirs to notions of valor (cf. Homeric "clothed in valor")—such phrases are "creases in the minds of Proto-Indo-European people from whom we are all descended" (170). For the Indo-European and Proto-Indo-European in Homer, see Émile Benveniste, Dictionary of Indo-European Concepts and Society, Elizabeth Palmer, tr. (Faber and Faber 1973: Hau Books, 2016), orig. pub. Le vocabulaire des institutions indo-européens (Les Editions de Minuit, 1969); J. P. Mallory, In Search of the Indo-Europeans: Language, Archaeology and Myth (Thames and Hudson, 1989); Calvert Watkins, How to Kill a Dragon: Aspects of Indo-European Poetics (Oxford Univ. Press, 1995).

between past and present. Jan Paul Crielaard, "Past or Present? Epic Poetry, Aristocratic Self-representation and the Concept of Time in the Eighth and Seventh Centuries B.C." in *Omero tremila anni dopo*, Franco Montanari, ed., Atti del Congresso di Genova 6-8 Iuglio 2000. Con la collaborazione di Paolo Ascheri (Storia e Letteratura [210], 2002), 283–284. For discussion of time as it relates to the *Iliad*'s own characters within the context of the Trojan War and its aftermath, see *TLL*, Chapter 18: "Cataclysm Averted: Homer's Separation of Helen and Achilles" (focusing on why Achilles and Helen never so much as view or speak to each other in the *Iliad*, and why Homer thus determinedly separates the lethal pair).

Reference to Heracles. E.g., *Il.* 5.700-717, 8.403-417, 11.768-774, 14.265-268, 15.26-36, 20.161-166. For Heracles as heroic prototype, and for the afterlife of the word "hero" and related terms in American and European culture through 9/11 and beyond, see Silk, et al., *The Classical Tradition*, 263–275.

an earlier sack of Troy. The legend is intermittently related at *Il.* 5.700-717, 14.265-268, 20.161-166, and 21.495-512 (see preceding note). Having thus cheated Heracles, Laomedon is emblematic of Trojan perfidy both before and during the war. See Pura Nieto Hernández, "Reading Homer in the 21st Century," *College Literature*, 34.2 (2007), 42–43; and C. J. Mackie, "Iliad 24 and the Judgement of Paris," *Classical Quarterly*, 63.1 (2013), 6–7. For a summary of the legend, see Walter Leaf, *The Iliad* (Macmillan, 1888, 1902), Vol. II, 359 (note to line 145).

Hera's kleos = Heracles. "Heracles" initially indicates the "kleos of Hera" (Gr. hērōs 'hero' cognate with Hērē 'Hera'), Hera and Zeus regularly arguing over Heracles. It is for Eurystheus that Heracles performs the Twelve Labors. I elsewhere note that "Heroism in its proximately post-creational phase protects civilization from the residuum of chaos. Heracles, in slaying primordial beasts (among other labors), exemplifies this kind of heroism, the "beneficent, regulatory force that fights against the disorderly and abnormal forces of nature which are in the process of being formed, or which have not yet entirely subsided" (*TLL*, 182–183). On the "unseasonality" of the hero's life, see Nagy, *The Ancient Greek Hero*, 33–47 (Heracles' birth delayed, Achilles' death hastened; seasonality restored in cult worship after death). For other aspects of Heracles in relation

to Achilles and the *Iliad*, see *TLL*, 608 (note to p. 183, citing sources).

the ekphrastic Shield. Ekphrasis (Gr. *ek* 'outside of' + *phrasis* 'statement') is the lengthy description of an object, interrupting the narrative or inserted for its own sake. The Shield of Achilles is the first and foremost instance in Western literature, imitated by Virgil and others.

21 earlier-storied generation. The earlier generation of heroes, including Cadmus (founder and first king of Thebes), Theseus, Perithous, Perseus, Bellerophon, and ultimately Heracles are, as noted, concerned with cosmic preservation, with the suppression of anomalous creation. Monster-slaying is their stock-in-trade. With cosmic preservation assured, the generation of heroes at Troy focuses on self-preservation through fame (see *TLL*, Chapters 15 and 16), now acquired through adversarial slayings on the battlefield. Theseus and Perithous appear on the fringe of events leading to the Trojan War as would-be abductors of Helen in her childhood—Theseus a mythologically estimated 50 years old at the time (*TLL*, 222–223). For the thesis that "the *Iliad* needs to be read in the context of the heroic history alluded to within the poem itself," see C. J. Mackie, *Rivers of Fire: Mythic Themes in Homer's Iliad* (New Academic Publishing, 2008), 5.

archaic to listeners since. For Nestor's speech at *Il.* 11.727-901— as for all things concerning Nestor, including the earliest origins of his name and function—see the monumental work of Douglas Frame, *Hippota* [*Horseman*] *Nestor* (Center for Hellenic Studies, 2009; fourth corrected printing, 2014), especially Part 1: Nestor's Indo-European Background, and Part 2: Nestor's Homeric Role: Ch. 4, "Iliad 11."

22 fairy-tale elements. E.g., the singular (and solitary) mention, in mid-combat, of the fresh water spirit "Abarbarea" injects an amatory/procreational account from a time and place long past.

... Euryalus
Downed Dresus and Opheltius, and next pursued
Pedasus and Aesepus —whom the naiad nymph
Abarbarea bore blameless Bucoliön,
He Laomedōn's eldest son, a bastard born,

Who, tending his flock, with the naiad lay the night; And she conceiving bore him twins whose sturdy limbs Euryalus unloosed, offstripping their armor.

(Il. 6.21-28; cf. 2.924-927)

Cf. 13.469-473 (naiad, in mid-combat genealogical gloss, mentioned but not named);16.160-162 (birth of Achilles' war horse, Podargē, in rural setting). So also, "even exquisite Castianeira / From Aesymē brought, in beauty a goddess born" (8.346-347).

lands on a feudal model. Though the *Iliad* gives rise to their inference, it does not describe the workings of feudal or tenurial relationships as between donor, donee, and the already existing inhabitants of the "donated" cities. Finley disclaims feudal or tenurial relationships (despite Linear B support) with the warning, "Tenure is not to be confused with allegiance to a sovereign." See M. I. Finley, "Homer and Mycenae: Property and Tenure," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte*, 6.2 (1957), 139. Finley's argument is the self-admitted proof of a negative. Here, as in his *The World of Odysseus*,

Finley discounts a Mycenaean influence on Homer, given what he considers the break and total discontinuity between the Mycenaean and Homeric worlds (136, and n. 1). He further disclaims the often assumed historicity of the expedition against Troy and deems Troy's destruction by human hands inconclusive. See M. I. Finley, J. L. Caskey, G. S. Kirk, and D. L. Page, "The Trojan War," *The Journal of Hellenic Studies*, 84 (1964), 1–20 (and especially Kirk's rebuttal, 15–17).

Donative cities appear to have survived into the classical period, as told of the Athenian general, Themistocles. "Most writers say that he had three cities given him, Magnesia, Myers, and Lampsacus to maintain him in bread, meat, and wine." Plutarch, *Themistocles*, in *Plutarch: Lives of Illustrious Men* (The Spencer Press, 1936), 23.

the line blurred between. Camille Saint-Saëns appraises the melding of Greek history and mythology as follows:

It is a question whether there is any essential difference between history and mythology. History is made up of what probably happened; mythology of what probably did not happen. There are myths in history and history in myths. Mythology is merely the old form of history. Every myth is rooted in truth. And we have to seek for this truth in the fable, just as we try to reconstruct extinct animals from the remains Time has preserved to us.

Midway between the two, Saint-Saëns places sacred writings—in the Western tradition, the Old and New Testament. See "History and Mythology in Opera," *Musical Memories*, Edwin Gile Rich, tr. (BiblioBazaar, n.d.), 47.

largely for administrative. Certain cities, including Mycenae, Pylos, and Knossos were deemed "palatial centers" since they "had an administrative structure documented by Linear B archives." Emiliano Arena, "Peripheries during the Palatial Age: The Case of Achaia," *Hesperia*, 84.1 (2015), 2.

objects of jewelry. See Emily Townsend Vermeule, review: Ancient Mycenae, the Capital City of Our Agamemnon, by George E. Mylonas, American Journal of Archaeology, 62.1 (1958), 116 ("Circle B" findings). See the description of an elaborately pedigreed boartusk helmet that the Cretan Mērionēs lends to Odysseus (Il. 10.278-284).

Mask of Agamemnon. For controversy surrounding the mask, see Oliver Dickinson, "The Face of Agamemnon," *Hesperia*, 74.3 (2005), 299–308 (Schliemann did not originally associate the mask with Agamemnon, the allegation disproven that Schliemann "planted" the mask as a forgery.)

23 the Gilgamesh epic. See Webster, 79–90; Louis H. Feldman, "Homer and the Near East: The Rise of the Greek Genius," The Biblical Archaeologist, 59.1 (1996), 13–21.; M. L. West, The East Face of Helicon: West Asiatic Elements in Greek Poetry (Oxford Univ. Press, 1997, 2003), Chapters 7 and 8; and Charles Rowan Beye, Ancient Epic Poetry: Homer, Apollonius, Virgil, with a Chapter on the Gilgamesh Poems (Bolchazy-Carducci, 2006, 2d ed.). Most recently, Sophus Helle, Gilgamesh: A New Translation of the Ancient Epic, with Essays on the Poem, Its Past, and Its Passion (Yale Univ. Press, 2021), review: Robert Macfarlane, "A Fireball from the Sands," New York Review of Books, 10/20/2022.

and rarefied vocabulary. Helle, xii-xiv.

antiquity: Utan-apishti, etc. Helle, 126.

- **24 un-Hellenic** *objet d'art*. On the origin and uses of the term "Hellenic," see pp. xviii, xviv.
- 25 **invaluable lessons of style.** Arnold, *On Translating Homer*, 220. For further discussion, see *TLL*, 6–9.

engaged with the topic. See *TLL*, 6–9, 138, 368, 461–462.

the Victorian prose *Iliad.* Preceded by the Victorian prose *Odyssey* of Samuel Henry Butcher and Andrew Lang (1879).

26 delivering the intended effect. Gordon Braden, review: Homer in English by George Steiner, Translation and Literature, 6.2 (1997), 237.

of Shakespeare's plays. Mark W. Edwards, "Homer's Iliad" in *A Companion to Ancient Epic*, John Miles Foley, ed. (Wiley-Blackwell, 2009), 307. Cf. Preface epigraph.

English verse translation. The emphasis on *verse*. An earlier King Jamesian prose translation of the *Iliad*—Lang, Leaf & Meyers (1883)—immensely popular in its time, was later deemed "excessively archaic" (see *TLL*, 8, 461–462).

- or consonant sound. From at least 1925 to date, Homeric alliteration has been noted, though with few conclusions concerning its stylistic or other import. See, e.g., A. Shewan, "Alliteration and Assonance in Homer," Classical Philology, 20.3 (1925), 193-209 (making no reference to θ -/thēta-based alliteration [discussed at length herein, both below and at the conclusion of Part II], and deeming θ -assonance as "rather obnoxious to the modern ear"): Michael N. Nagler "Toward a Generative View of the Oral Formula." Transactions of the American Philological Association, 98 (1967), 293–294 (offering no view on the issue of alliteration's "poetic meaningfulness or its absence in Homeric diction"); David W. Packard, "Sound-Patterns in Homer," Transactions of the American Philological Association, 104 (1974), 239-260 (offering a "statistical perspective" and, for the first time, tabulating the frequency of various sounds in Homer; focus limited to the "single verse as the unit of measure" [258]; θ -/thēta-based alliteration limited to Il. 23.770, which "uses more θ's than any other line in Homer" [253]); W. B. Stanford, "Varieties of Sound-Effects in the Homeric Poems," College Literature, 3.3 (1976), 219–227 (hailing Packard's approach); Stanford, The Sound of Greek: Studies in the Greek Theory and Practice of Euphony (Univ. of California Press, 1976), 74-98 (examining the "choice of words for the sake of their suitability in rhythm, voice-melody, timbre-quality, tempo, and volume variation, as well as for their meaning" [78]); and Stanford, "Sound, Sense and Music in Greek Poetry," Greece & Rome, 28.2 (1981), 127–140.
- 42 **traduce than translate.** *TLL*, xxviii, 27 (referencing the adage *traduttore traditore* 'the translator is a traitor').
- 44 an inflected language. For the general reader's guide to inflection in a classical language, see TSS, 206–217 (discussing Horace, Odes 1.5), and pp. 41, 44–45. One may further benefit from Margaret Schlauch, The Gift of Tongues (Modern Age Books, 1942). A consummate and controversial linguist of her day, Schlauch's book (one of many) is a layman's guide to linguistics and language usage. Most helpful vis-à-vis the present work is her Chapter 9: "Language and Poetic Creation." See especially 251 ("Shift of Grammatical Category"), beginning, "Since the Renaissance, poets have been making use of the elasticity of English grammar." Schlauch here discusses inflections, inversions, and poetic styles ranging from the colloquial to the Miltonic.

polemō(i) 'to or for war'. The (i) is a transliterated iota subscript. The Greek word appears as πολέμφ (iota subscripted to, or written beneath, the preceding ω /omega vowel).

45 **need for punctuation.** The earliest written texts of Homer were in unaccent-marked uppercase letters, without spaces between words, and without punctuation. See e.g., The "Hawara Homer" papyrus (Egypt, c. 150 BC), discussed (with illustration) in Recapturing a Homeric Legacy: Images and Insights from the Venetus A Manuscript of the Iliad, Casey Dué, ed. (Center for Hellenic Studies, 2009), 22–26. Accentmarked lower-case texts with word separations and modest punctuation were made by the Alexandrian editors of Homer (3d and 2d centuries BC) as an aid to readers (by then approximately 500 years distant from Homer). The preeminent example is the tenth-century AD "Venetus A," the oldest complete text of the Iliad in existence, preserving in its margins Alexandrian, Roman, and Byzantium scholarship from the second century BC to the Middle Ages (Dué, 1). The manuscript is housed at the Biblioteca Marciana—Library of St. Mark—in Venice (Venetus 'Venetian'). There is also the preeminent "Bankes Homer Papyrus" (Egypt, c. 150 AD), a long and excellently preserved papyrus in sixteen columns containing Il. 24.127-804 (purchased by explorer William John Bankes in 1821; acquired by the British Museum in 1879).

English, by contrast. One should say "largely uninflected," as the Old English of Beowulf was fully inflected, a feature almost entirely shed with the simplification of English from Old, to Middle/Chaucerian, to Early Modern/Shakespearean English. Thus (you) "sayest" and (he) "sayeth" are inflected Elizabethan forms as are, today, "says" (suffix-inflected verb designating person and number) and "laughed" (suffix-inflected verb designating tense). Pronouns retain the fullest inflection, designating person, number, gender, and case, e.g., I/me, we/us, she/her, they/them. Vestiges of inflection also appear in plural endings or vowel changes, e.g., man/men, mouse/mice, foot/feet, ox/oxen; so also in irregular verbs, e.g., am, was, been; write, wrote, written, etc.

rule-governed phenomenon. Olav Hackstein, "The Greek of Epic" in Bakker, ed., 404. Hackstein designates another "all-pervasive archaism" in the absence from Homer of the definite article "the" (eventually derived from the demonstrative pronoun "this, that"). Thus, the opening word of the *Iliad, mēnin* '(the) wrath', would in later Greek require the definite article, *tēn mēnin* 'the wrath' being something clearly identifiable or known. So also the first word of the *Odyssey: andra* '(the) man', later *ton andra* 'the man', and so on. The necessity of the definite article is attested in English translation, which invariably uses it. See further *TLL*, 434.

"Remarkably archaic," continues Hackstein, is the suffix - $\varphi\iota$ (-phi) 'with', "which had fallen out of general use by post-Mycenaean Greek." We thus note, in a marked infusion of archaic usage, Chrysēs' prayer to Apollo [Il. 1.38] containing the words $I\varphi\iota$ ἀνάσσεις (Iphi (f)anasseis) 'with might you rule' (Gr. Is 'might'; the Is dropped to accommodate the -Is suffix). The first word contains the archaic -Is suffix, while the second relies on the already obsolete digamma (Is) (Is), thus preventing hiatus (Is) in the two-word phrase. In the same vein, one may compare

Aτρεΐδης τε **ἄναξ** ἀνδρῶν καὶ **δῖος** ἀχιλλεύς Atreïdēs te (**f**) anax andrōn kai di(**f**) os Achilleus Agamemnon king of men and dread Achilles.

[Il. 1.7]

Here, in the same line, obsolete digamma bridges the hiatus both between and within words: between te-anax and within di-os. Moreover, the prayer's opening imperative $\kappa\lambda\bar{\nu}\theta\iota$ 'hear' relies on the archaic imperative suffix $-\theta\iota$ (otherwise imp. klue 'hear'). Imperative klue 'hear' would properly scan, but the archaic form lends moment to the entreaty.

Hackstein further notes that the - ϕ I suffix serves metrical, stylistic, and archaizing purposes—in the last instance from "a desire for a diction removed from everyday contemporary speech" (the argument of Part II herein). A noteworthy comparable usage—with suffix - $\theta\epsilon(\nu)$ 'from'—prominently appears at the start of the <code>Odyssey</code> (see p. 54).

in subjunctive endings. Optional use of augment and short-vowel subjunctives are deemed Homeric archaisms. "The retention and survival of these [and other] archaisms were conditioned by metrical utility, but became integrated into the synchronic system of the [Homeric] *Kunstsprache*." Dag Haug, "Archaisms" in *The Homer Encyclopedia*, Vol. I. 79.

- 46 the Greek "particles." TLL, 454–455. The seminal work (672 pages upon initial publication) is John Dewar Denniston, The Greek Particles (Oxford Univ. at the Clarendon Press, 1934; 2d ed., 1954), known in the trade as "Denniston's Particles." Also instructive is D. B. Monro, A Grammar of the Homeric Dialect (Oxford Univ. at the Clarendon Press, 1892), 299–338. We need not conclude from David Goldstein's helpful update on particles scholarship that Denniston is now "woefully out of date." See Goldstein, "Discourse Particles in LSJ: A Fresh Look at γε" in Liddell & Scott: The History, Methodology, and Languages of the World's Leading Lexicon of Ancient Greek, Christopher Stray, Michael Clarke, and Joshua T. Katz, eds. (Oxford Univ. Press, 2019) 270, n. 5.
- 47 **in** [*Plutarch*] *Essay.* As the bracketed "[Plutarch]"—aka "Pseudo-Plutarch"—indicates, the authorship is doubtful. The *Essay* is, nonetheless, our most valuable source concerning the Roman Empire's view of Homer, first and second centuries AD. The essay was used as prefatory material by Renaissance editors of Homer, beginning with the first printed edition of Homer (1488), and thus greatly influenced Renaissance and later readers, who considered Plutarch an authority.
- 48 poem's direct discourse. The literature is, of course, extensive. See, e.g., Richard R. Martin, The Language of Heroes (Cornell Univ. Press, 1989); Deborah Beck, Homeric Conversation (Center for Hellenic Studies, 2005); Adam Parry, "The Language of Achilles, "Transactions of the American Philological Association, 87 (1956), 1–7; and Jeffrey M. Duban, "The Major Duels of the Iliad and the Language of Hector" (in French), Les Études Classiques, 49.2 (1981), 97–124.
- 49 daimónie 'My good sir'. "In everyday life one could rarely specify the god concerned, and thus spoke of a theós, theoí or daímôn, just as someone who speaks or acts oddly is addressed as daimónie." Janko (1994), 2–3 (Greek transliterated).

points or crucial events. The referenced confrontation of Achilles and Aeneas, dooming Aeneas to death, is another such crucial event (*Il.* 20.178-341). But because Aeneas is destined to survive (ultimately for the founding of Rome), his death by Achilles would countermand fate (cf. *Il.* 5.346-354, 490-501; Aeneas badly wounded by Diomedes—rescued by Aphrodite and Apollo, healed by Leto and Artemis). The moment preceding their clash, Poseidon whisks Aeneas to safety (*Il.* 20.352-365), but

JEFFREY M. DUBAN

not before lengthy discussion with the gods (20.324-354), thus "freezing" an imminent event. Alternatively, time is spooled out like toffee in Achilles' deadly pursuit of Hector. See Jeffrey M. Duban, "Distortion as a Poetic Device in the 'Pursuit of Hector' and Related Events," *Aevum*, 54 (1980), 3–22.